

**Benjamin McKay Ayotte. *Heinrich Schenker: A Guide to Research*. Routledge Music Bibliographies. New York and London: Routledge, 2004. xix + 322 pp.**

**David Carson Berry. *A Topical Guide to Schenkerian Literature: An Annotated Bibliography with Indices*. Harmonologia: Studies in Music Theory No. 11. Hillsdale, NY: Pendragon Press, 2004. xi + 585 pp.**

### **Review by William Marvin**

The appearance of two extended bibliographic guides to the work of Heinrich Schenker, his students, and those who espouse his analytic method is cause for celebration. Students and professionals now have up-to-date volumes that allow for efficient reference to current and past research, with alternative modes for searching through what is a continuously expanding field. Both volumes under review contain extensive commentary describing the contents of most entries, further enhancing their usefulness to the scholar.

Bibliographies are not typically read from cover to cover – rather they are used as references for looking up needed information, or they are browsed through in a more-or-less systematic manner. In reviewing these two large-scale bibliographies devoted to the theory of Heinrich Schenker, I found myself contemplating the differences between reading, constructing, and navigating a bibliography. The organizational features of each volume created a strong influence on my perceptions, both as I considered the contents, and the effectiveness with which each of the two works under review presented those contents to a researcher in the field. In short, the two modes of presentation chosen by the bibliographers provide complementary guides to a vibrant and expanding body of research. My review will focus on the scope of each volume, organizational strategies employed by each bibliographer, end matter and other finding aids, and production values.

## Scope

The two volumes represent by far the most complete surveys of Schenkerian literature currently extant. With Ayotte's 1500+ entries and Berry's 2200 (3600 if subsidiary/related entries are included), no other survey of the Schenkerian literature comes close in terms of number of sources catalogued and examined. This said, it would be incorrect to imagine that earlier bibliographies have been completely superseded by these publications. Just as the two volumes in question differ from each other considerably in coverage, organization, and critical summaries of the sources, so do they differ from earlier bibliographies by Beach, Damschroder/Williams, and Meeùs, to name the most prominent and useful earlier surveys of Schenkerian literature (for complete citations, see the list of references at the end of this review). For these reasons, researchers may still wish to refer to these earlier bibliographies. Researchers will also need to consult the more specialized finding lists of Larry Laskowski, Nicholas Rast, Robert Kosovsky, and Robert Lang and JoAn Kunselman for assistance in navigating the specific contents of Schenker's own published and unpublished work, as these are topics that are necessarily omitted from the two volumes under review.

Both bibliographies contain a number of entries for books or articles that are "forthcoming." One understands why the authors wished to include these sources, given that bibliographies are in some sense out of date as soon as they are in print, and also that there is a lag time between a book or article's acceptance for publication and its appearance before the public. The risk of listing such items is that all too often, for whatever reason, the listed work either does not come forth, or it appears in a different form (change of title, publisher, etc.). This appears to be the case with at least some of the listings found in both Ayotte's and Berry's publications.

## Organization

The two bibliographies could not be more different from each other in overall organization. Ayotte presents the more conventional approach. After an introduction by the author situating Schenker's work within current intellectual discourse on

musical analysis, the book presents sources listed under six chapter headings: Sources of Biographical Information, Works of Heinrich Schenker, Articles on Schenker and his Approach, Books on Schenker and his Approach, Dissertations and Theses on Schenker and his Approach, and Electronic Schenker Resources. Chapter Two presents a unique contribution to research in that it includes a list of Schenker's published and unpublished compositions, along with thematic incipits for each work; to my knowledge, such a listing is unavailable elsewhere.

One would expect the ordering of sources within each medium to be chronological, and then alphabetical by author within each year, but here the user is confronted with some problematic inconsistencies. While Schenker's own writings and translations are listed chronologically, the articles, books, and dissertations in Chapters 3-5 are listed in *reverse* chronological order, with recent entries first. Indeed, the first entries are occasionally "forthcoming" items, as referred to above. Further, the order of entries within a given year is clearly intended to be alphabetical by author, but there are a significant number of (accidental?) exceptions to this principle, making it more difficult to quickly access a source the user remembers chronologically but requires a full citation for. Finally, each of these chapters concludes with a brief collection of "additional sources," which appear to be works included in the final stages of the book's production. Perhaps the most unfortunate result of this organizational choice relates to the prospect for future editions of the bibliography: in order to add sources, the entire index will need to be rebuilt from the ground up, since any newer sources would be added at the beginning and internal reference numbers for all succeeding citations would shift. It is strongly recommended that the author re-order these chapters chronologically in a future edition.<sup>1</sup>

Berry's approach to the material is much more like a librarian's approach to cataloging: he presents a strictly hierarchical outline of topics, with each entry presented according to carefully considered criteria for inclusion, placement, and related materials. Berry describes and justifies his organizational scheme in an

---

<sup>1</sup> As a reviewer, I chose to read through each of these chapters in reverse order, thus creating the chronological survey of the literature subverted by the actual organization of the bibliography. One obvious advantage of this reading was that it provided a better understanding of the history of Schenkerian studies.

extended introductory essay, which is itself an important contribution to scholarship. Not only does the essay describe the organization of the volume in question, but also it offers general principles for creating and organizing any bibliographic project that will be useful to many readers.

Berry's outline consists of fifteen large headings, 70 sub-headings, and 271 divided categories. As such, it offers all of the advantages one finds when using a well-catalogued research library: each item can be found where it belongs, with related items nearby. The benefits to research for such an organizational scheme are clear: by browsing entries in proximity to the one referenced first, other sources are discovered that often enhance one's understanding of the topic. Berry's large headings are listed below in Example 1, with my own short descriptors (Berry's own are presented in much greater detail on pp. 9-23 in his book). As with any library, each individual reader will have his or her own questions about the appropriate placement of a given source within the hierarchy, or even about the actual categories. And also as with any library, the effective use of the book depends on acceptance of the categories and commitment to learning them. I imagine that a second edition of the book would eliminate some categories of the outline while replacing them with new categories that will emerge from new research. Berry's work here represents a monumental and effective organizational strategy for this corpus of material, and all researchers can be grateful for his sifting and cataloguing the current state of research so effectively.

*Example 1. Large Categories within Berry's Bibliography.*

- I. Foundational Texts
- II. Schenker and Aural Phenomena
- III. Specific Theoretical/Analytic Concepts
- IV. Schenkerian Interpretations of Melodic and Harmonic Events
- V. Temporal/Rhythmic Aspects of Music
- VI. Musical Properties
- VII. Compositional Types: Forms, Genres, Processes
- VIII. Extensions of Schenker's Theory Beyond the Twelve Canonical Composers

- IX. Extensions of Schenker's Theory *via*  
Interdisciplinary/Combined Methodology
- X. Schenker's Theory in  
Historical/Philosophical/Aesthetic Contexts
- XI. Autograph Studies and Performance Practice
- XII. Miscellanea, including Schenkerian Analyses of Music  
by the Twelve Canonical Composers
- XIII. Anthologies of Schenkerian Writings
- XIV. Schenker Himself: His Writings, Biography, *Nachlass*,  
Translations, Reception
- XV. Other Bibliographic and Analytic Indices

In general, I have found Berry's hierarchy to be eminently sensible and useful as a scheme for organizing a mature and thriving field of research. Perhaps the most idiosyncratic of his decisions is heading XIV: it seems that Schenker's own work should be listed first and foremost within the hierarchy, as it is the *raison d'être* for the entire project. Further, I would recommend listing all translations under the main headings of the original publication, as related items, rather than under a separate sub-heading with cross-reference to the original. These small points aside, there is no difficulty finding the sources one is searching for.

### Indices/Cross-References

No extended bibliography would be particularly useful without indices or cross-referencing – in effect, the card catalog or search engine which allows researchers to find sources through the largest possible number of pathways. While a printed volume, or the physical layout of a library, dictates a single physical placement for each entry or item, and thus necessitates a strict filing hierarchy, cross-references, indices, and search engines cut across strict hierarchies to create networks.<sup>2</sup> In this sense, printed volumes are probably not the best media for large-scale bibliographies, as they require extensive cross-referencing tools for successful navigation. A more useful format would be to market the bibliographies as

---

<sup>2</sup> For a discussion of various types of hierarchies, and their implications within Schenkerian theory, see Cohn and Dempster 1992.

CD-ROMs, with self-contained search-engines allowing users to navigate the internal network quickly and effectively from a variety of search parameters. Indeed, the advantages of such a format could include the ability to cut-and-paste the resulting citations directly into one's own document, the possibility of easily sent updates to the bibliographic database, and even HTML links to full-text online sources.

Dreams of the near future aside, both volumes contain extensive finding aids. Ayotte's volume contains an author index, a topical index (which mimics some of the large topics of Berry's cataloguing system), and a composer/works index. Within these indices, the user is referred to catalogue numbers of bibliographic entries within the main body of the work. Reviews are listed in the body of the text under the main entry, but translations or reprints usually receive separate entries, not always with a cross-reference. Ayotte's composer index is a fine idea in that it offers the possibility of searching for multiple analyses of a single composition. Unfortunately it is not executed as successfully as users might wish. The order of works presented under each composer heading is inconsistent within the volume, appearing sometimes by opus or other cataloguing number (Köchel, BWV, etc.), sometimes alphabetically by title, and sometimes apparently randomly. Further, this index is noticeably incomplete: among Schenker's own works, his *Tonwille* and *Meisterwerk* essays seem to be catalogued, but analyses appearing in *Der freie Satz* do not appear in this index. Also, numerous analyses in the secondary literature are not to be found here, even when the work appears in the title of the cited article.

Berry's volume provides indices of composer references and authors. Berry also includes a short description of what is and is not included within his composer index. Most notable in its absence is a listing of individual pieces analyzed; it is hoped that such a finding aid can be provided in future editions of the bibliography. The indices refer users to a location within Berry's hierarchical outline. Berry further offers numerous cross-references and "see also..." references within the main section of the bibliography, allowing browsers to jump from branch to branch rather than climbing down the tree and then up again to access a different limb. Finally, Berry provides tremendously useful finding aids in that he lists full pagination for all sources, provides English translations of all non-English titles, and identifies the work of

Schenker's students with a special symbol next to the appropriate entries.

### **Production Values**

It is virtually impossible to avoid typographical errors completely in works of this size and genre. The best one can hope for is that careful proofreading will eliminate most errors, and that sympathetic readers will inform the author of the remaining errors for future editions. Berry's volume contains very few errors of any type (it even arrived with a brief errata sheet). The most obvious (and unfortunate) of these is the misspelling of the author's name on the spine of the book.

Unfortunately, it appears that Ayotte's book needed much more thorough copy-editing than the typescript received. I located an average of more than one typographical error per page – an inexcusably large number for a text by a reputable publisher. The errors are even more inexplicable given that Routledge has made a specialty of publishing research guide bibliographies for academic musicians. While the errors range from formatting errors through simple spelling and grammar mistakes, perhaps the most embarrassing category relates to misspelled names: among the major authors in the field whose names are misspelled or incorrectly identified here are Charles Burkhart, Matthew Brown, Joseph Lubben, Hedi Siegel, Cristle Collins Judd, Ray Jackendoff, Carl Schachter, Boyd Pomeroy, and Nicolas Meeùs.

There can be no such thing as “one stop shopping” in the world of academic research. Since bibliographies are in some sense out of date the moment they reach publication, researchers must continue to be aware of the ongoing march of scholarship through numerous avenues. Additionally, navigating bibliographies, libraries, and search engines, all of which employ different organizational strategies, fosters the new neural connections that create new and original work. Benjamin Ayotte's and David Berry's complementary volumes are both useful tools that will improve musical scholarship, and it is hoped that they will be used heavily and updated regularly.

## References

- Beach, David. 1969. "A Schenker Bibliography." *Journal of Music Theory* 13/1: 2-37.  
Reprinted in Maury Yeston, ed. *Readings in Schenkerian Analysis and Other Approaches*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1977: 275-311.
- . 1979. "A Schenker Bibliography: 1969-1979." *Journal of Music Theory* 23/2: 275-86.
- . 1985. "The Current State of Schenkerian Research." *Acta Musicologica* 57: 275-307.
- . 1989. "Schenkerian Theory." *Music Theory Spectrum* 11/1: 3-14.
- Cohn, Richard, and Douglas Dempster. 1992. "Hierarchical Unity, Plural Unities: Toward a Reconciliation," in Katherine Bergeron and Philip V. Bohlman, eds., *Disciplining Music: Musicology and its Canons*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press: 156-81.
- Damschroder, David Allen, and David Russell Williams. 1990. *Music Theory from Zarlino to Schenker*. Hillsdale, NY: Pendragon Press.
- Kosovsky, Robert. 1990. "The Oster Collection: Papers of Heinrich Schenker: A Finding List." New York: New York Public Library, Music Division.
- Lang, Robert, and JoAn Kunselman. 1994. *Heinrich Schenker, Oswald Jonas, Moritz Violin: A Checklist of Manuscripts and Other Papers in the Oswald Jonas Memorial Collection*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Laskowski, Larry. 1978. *Heinrich Schenker: An Annotated Index to His Analyses of Musical Works*. Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon Press.
- Meeùs, Nicolas. 1993. *Heinrich Schenker: Une Introduction*. Liège: Mardaga.
- Rast, Nicholas. 1988. "A Checklist of Essays and Reviews by Heinrich Schenker." *Music Analysis* 7/2: 121-32.